ORIGINAL

## OFFICIAL FILE STATE OF ILLINOIS ILLINOIS ILLINOIS ILLINOIS ILLINOIS COMMERCE COMMISSION

Illinois Bell Telephone Company	)	Jul 19	1 40 PM '01
Proposed Implementation of High	)	Docket No. 00-0393	
Frequency Portion of the Loops (HFPL)  Line Sharing Service	`) `	Onici	

## ALCATEL USA, INC.'S MOTION TO QUASH THE SUBPOENA RELATED TO THE SECOND SET OF DATA REQUESTS OF RHYTHMS LINKS, INC., COVAD COMMUNICATIONS COMPANY, AND SPRINT COMMUNICATIONS, L.P. TO ALCATEL USA, INC.

- 1. Pursuant to Illinois Commerce Commission Rules of Practice and Illinois Supreme Court Rules, Alcatel USA, Inc. ("Alcatel") hereby moves to quash the Subpoena Duces Tecum issued July 13, 2001 related to the Second Set of Data Requests of Rhythms Links, Inc., Covad Communications Company, and Sprint Communications, L.P. to Alcatel U.S.A., Inc., attached hereto as Attachment A.
- 2. Alcatel hereby moves to quash the subpoena in its entirety, in particular with respect to Requests 1-3 of the Second Set of Data Requests, on the grounds that each is unreasonable, oppressive, and relates to irrelevant or immaterial matters. Alcatel believes that the primary effect of this discovery request is to harass Alcatel, rather than to lead to the discovery of any information related to the subject matter of Dr. Ransom's testimony. As such, each of these Requests seeks to impose obligations on Alcatel beyond the Illinois Commerce Commission Rules of Practice and Illinois Supreme Court Rules. Without limiting the generality of the foregoing, Alcatel moves to quash Requests 1-3.
- 3. Alcatel specifically moves the Examiner to quash Requests 1.1–1.6 on the grounds that these Requests are irrelevant to Dr. Ransom's testimony before the Commission. Alcatel has been public regarding its plans to rely, for business reasons, more heavily on outsourced manufacturing in the future. The location and ownership of the plants manufacturing Alcatel equipment relate in no way to any of Dr. Ransom's testimony before the Commission, which relates to the design of the Litespan plug-in line cards and NGDLC equipment, the interoperability and compatibility between the component parts, and the likelihood of negative consequences should equipment having an improper or incompatible design be used in combination with this equipment. Under manufacturing outsourcing arrangements such as those presently contemplated by Alcatel, the fabrication plants gain no rights whatsoever in the design of the products or any rights to make use of the designs other than to populate integrated circuit boards according to Alcatel's design and direction. As such, the information requested is irrelevant and immaterial to Dr. Ransom's testimony before the Commission and Alcatel therefore moves the Examiner to quash the subpoena.

- 4. Alcatel specifically moves the Examiner to quash Request 2 on same grounds as Requests 1.1 1.6, in that these Requests, which seek essentially the same information, are irrelevant to Dr. Ransom's testimony before the Commission. As such, the information requested is irrelevant and immaterial to Dr. Ransom's testimony before the Commission and Alcatel therefore moves the Examiner to quash the subpoena.
- 5. Alcatel specifically moves the Examiner to quash Request 3 on the grounds that it is duplicative in that this Request substantially requests the same information as that provided in response to Request #4 of the First set of Requests. As such, this request is duplicative of earlier discovery requests and Alcatel therefore moves the Examiner to quash the subpoena.
- 6. In addition to the above, Alcatel moves the Examiner to quash the subpoena in its entirety on the grounds that it is unreasonable and oppressive, and at this late point in time, has the primary effect of harassment of Alcatel rather than the production of any information relevant to the testimony of Dr. Ransom. If the parties seeking this discovery truly felt that the outsourcing data presently sought was relevant to Dr. Ransom's testimony, they had ample opportunity to request such information well before July 9, 2001. In fact, however, the requesting parties, acting according to what appears at this point to be their standard operating procedure, delayed in filing their request until July 9, and then delayed in filing their subpoena until July 13. Under 83 Ill. Admin. Code § 200.380, with which the requesters are no doubt familiar, a subpoena is not, except in the case of an emergency, to be issued until seven days have been provided for a response. In this case, no such emergency exists, and the only situation partly resembling an

emergency was created by the requesting parties themselves. Accordingly, Alcatel moves the Examiner to quash the present subpoena rather than rewarding the requesting parties for their repeated maneuvering tactics.

Respectfully submitted,

July 16, 2001

(KON EMANGESON)

Rendi L. Mann-Stadt

HINSHAW & CULBERTSON 400 South Ninth Street, Suite 200 Springfield, Illinois 62701-1908

Phone:

(217) 528-7375

Fax:

(217) 528-0075

Robert J. Miller

Ted Shiells

Daniel J. Chalker

GARDERE WYNNE SEWELL LLP

1601 Elm Street, Suite 3000

Dallas, Texas 75201-4761

Phone:

(214) 999-3000

Fax:

(214) 999-4667

ATTORNEYS FOR ALCATEL USA, INC.

## CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

This is to certify that a true and correct copy of the foregoing document was served on July 16, 2001 by hand at the Renaissance Hotel, Springfield Illinois, to the following:

Rhythms Links, Inc. ("Rhythms") by and through its attorney, Stephen P. Bowen, Blumenfeld & Cohen;

Covad Communications Company ("Covad") by and through its attorney, Felicia Franco-Feinberg; and

Sprint Communications, L.P. ("Sprint") by and through its attorney, Kenneth Schifman, Sprint Communications, L.P.

This is to further certify that a true and correct copy of the foregoing document was served via regular mail on July 16, 2001 to the following:

Penny Bewick Atty. For New Edge Networks Davis Wright Tremaine LLP 3000 Columbia House Boulevard Vancouver, Wa 98668

Christian F Binnig
Atty. For Illinois Bell Telephone Company
Mayer, Brown & Platt
190 S. Lasalle St.
Chicago, Il 60603-3441

Steve Bowen
Atty. For Rhythms Links, Inc.
Blumenfeld & Cohen
4 Embarcadero Center, Ste. 1170
San Francisco, Ca 94111

Sean R Brady Office Of General Counsel Ilinois Commerce Commission 160 N. Lasalle St., Ste. C-800 Chicago, Il 60601-3104 Eric J Branfman Atty. For Clec Coalition Members Swidler Berlin Shereff Friedman, LLP 3000 K St, Nw, Ste. 300 Washington, Dc 20007-5116

Donna M Coles Johnson Atty. For Clec Coalition Members Swidler Berlin Shereff Friedman LLP 3000 K. St., Nw, Ste. 300 Washington, Dc 20007

R Dale Dixon Jr Atty. For New Edge Network, Inc. Davis Wright Tremaine LLP 1300 Sw Fifth Ave., Ste. 2300 Protland, Or 97201

Joseph E Donovan Atty. For Data Net Systems, Inc. O'keefe, Ashenden, Lyons & Ward 30 N. Lasalle St., Ste. 4100 Chicago, Il 60602

Felicia Franco-Feinberg Regional Counsel Covad Communications Company 227 W. Monroe, 20th Floor Chicago, Il 60606

Kara K Gibney Atty. For Illinois Bell Telephone Company Mayer Brown & Platt 190 S. Lasalle St. Chicago, Il 60603-3441

Brian R Gilomen Ameritech Advanced Data Services Of Illinois, Inc. 225 W. Randolph, 23a Chicago, Il 60606

Cheryl Hamill
At&T Communications Of Illinois, Inc.
222 W. Adams St., Ste. 1500
Chicago, Il 60606

Matthew L Harvey Office Of General Counsel Illinois Commerce Commission 160 N. Lasalle St., Ste. C-800 Chicago, Il 60601-3104

Nancy J Hertel Ameritech Illinois Floor 25d 225 W. Randolph St. Chicago, Il 60606

Carrie J Hightman Atty. For Rhythms Links, Inc. Schiff Hardin & Waite 233 S. Wacker Dr. 6600 Sears Tower Chicago, Il 60606

Henry T Kelly Atty. For Data Net Systems, Inc. O'keefe, Ashenden, Lyons & Ward 30 N. Lasalle St., Ste. 4100 Chicago, Il 60602

Latrice Kirkland Schiff Hardin & Waite 233 S. Wacker 6600 Sears Tower Chicago, Il 60606

Robert Koch Case Manager Illinois Commerce Commission 527 E. Capitol Ave. Springfield, Il 62701

Clyde Kurlander Atty. For Nextlink Illinois, Inc. 70 W. Madison Three First National Plaza, Ste. 2315 Chicago, Il 60602

Theresa P Larkin Illinois Bell Telephone Company 555 E. Cook St., Fl. 1e Springfield, Il 62721 Thomas R Lotterman Atty. For Clec Coalition Members Swidler Berlin Shereff Friedman LLP 3000 K St., Nw, Ste. 300 Washington, Dc 20007

Owen E Macbride Atty. For Intervenors Schiff Hardin & Waite 6600 Sears Tower Chicago, Il 60606

Jennifer Moore Illinois Commerce Commission 160 N. Lasalle St., Ste. C-800 Chicago, Il 60601-3104

Michael S Pabian Illinois Bell Telephone Company 225 W. Randolph, Hq13c Chicago, Il 60606

Carol Pomponio Nextlink Illinois, Inc. Concourse Level 303 E. Wacker Chicago, Il 60601

Paul J Rebey Focal Communications Corporation Suite 1100 200 N. Lasalle Chicago, Il 60601

Kenneth A Schifman Sprint Communications Company L.P. 8140 Ward Pkwy., 5e Kansas City, Mo 64114

Christy Strawman
Illinois Bell Telephone Company
555 E. Cook St., Fl. 1e
Springfield, Il 62721

Anita Taff-Rice Atty. For Rhythms Links, Inc. Blumenfeld & Cohen 4 Embarcadero Center, Ste. 1170 San Francisco, Ca 94111

Darrell Townsley State Regulatory & Governmental Affairs Worldcom, Inc. 205 N. Michigan Ave., Ste. 3700 Chicago, Il 60601

Julie Vanderlaan Illinois Commerce Commission 527 E. Capitol Ave. Springfield, Il 62701

John F Ward Jr Atty. For Data Net Systems, Inc. O'keefe, Ashenden, Lyons & Ward 30 N. Lasalle St., Ste. 4100 Chicago, Il 60602

Michael W Ward Atty. For Data Net Systems, Inc. Michael W. Ward, P.C. 1608 Barkley Blvd. Buffalo Grove, Il 60089

Nancy Wells Floor 3 913 South Sixth Street Springfield, Il 62703

KEN EMANUELSON